Boys’ Media as a Resource in Their Own Literacy Development

Dr. William G. Brozo
Professor of Literacy
George Mason University
Virginia, USA

Author of

To Be a Boy, To Be a Reader:
Engaging Teen and Preteen Boys in Active Literacy

Literacy in the Digital Age Conference, Vilnius, Lithuania, 20 January, 2017
Jacquis in *As You Like It*

And then the whining schoolboy
with his satchel and shiny morning face
creeping like a snail
unwillingly to school.

(Shakespeare, 1599)
Reynaldo, a ninth-grader

I have no idea how my parents or someone else could get me to read, because I don’t like reading. No one ever read to me before I fell asleep. No one ever bought me a book or some reading material they knew I might be into. And no one ever said, “You can do it, man,” or something like that.

(Washington, DC, 2010)
2nd Edition of *To be a Boy, To be a Reader: Engaging Teen and Preteen Boys in Active Literacy*
“A Boy’s Love of Reading
 Doesn’t Begin with Scholarship...
 It Begins with Discovery”
Why an advocacy position toward boys’ literacy development?
Social & Economic Justice

• Immigrant boys have the lowest levels of reading achievement

• Boys from low-income households have very low reading achievement
Male Sociopathy

• Males commit most suicides
• Males perpetrate most homicides
• Males commit most acts of family violence
• Males comprise most of the homeless
• Males comprise most drug addicts
• Males comprise most AIDS carriers

*Low levels of literacy are often associated with these syndromes
Literacy and academic achievement: The U.S.

• The average high school grade point average for girls is significantly higher than for boys
• Boys are almost twice as likely as girls to repeat a grade
• Boys are twice as likely to get suspended as girls, and three times as likely to be expelled
• 25% more boys drop out of school than girls
• Among whites, women earn 57% of bachelor’s degrees and 62% of master’s degrees
• Among African American women, the figures are 66% and 72%
• On national writing tests, 32% of girls are considered “proficient” or better; for boys, the figure is 16%
Literacy achievement: Globally

- Boys underperform relative to girls on most measures of verbal ability at the primary and secondary school levels

- Boys comprise much greater percentage of weak readers on PISA (Program for International Student Assessment) as compared with girls

- Boys have significantly lower levels of reading engagement than girls

- One of the four major “gaps” to be addressed as identified by the European High Level Group of Literacy Experts report
### Score Point Difference in favor of Girls on PISA for Selected Nordic & Baltic Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Estonia</th>
<th>Finland</th>
<th>Lithuania</th>
<th>Norway</th>
<th>Sweden</th>
<th>OECD Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Challenges to this position: Insidious sexism

• Males continue to dominate political, corporate, and institutional life in the U.S., Europe and elsewhere in the world

• As girls make significant strides academically and professionally, advocates of boys’ academic needs ensure male primacy by regularly invoking “crisis” to rally popular support
Challenges to this position: Hegemonic masculinity

• “Boy-friendly” curricular schemes do little more than perpetuate gender myths and stereotypes

• Binary notions of gender as a basis for literacy curricular decisions exclude all the different ways of “being male” or “being female”
Framing the issue as a boy “crisis”... 

Or seeking to find responsive instruction for boys

“Failing to meet the literacy needs of all young boys isn’t so much a crisis as it is an imperative educational challenge. Furthermore, concerns about boys’ reading attitudes and achievement should be framed around more responsive literacy instruction and interactions for all children. Boys need to be engaged and capable readers not solely to be as good as or better than girls, but to increase their educational, occupational, and civic opportunities and, above all, to become thoughtful and resourceful men.”

(Bright Beginnings for Boys, Zambo/Brozo, 2009)
Proposed causes for boys’ underachievement

- Peer pressure exerts a negative influence on boys who don’t see reading as “cool”
- Boys reading interests clash with more feminine curriculum texts
- Boys’ media and texts are not valued in schools and classrooms
- Male reading role models are absent in their peer group and at home
- A largely female school workforce impacts on boys’ perceptions of reading and their reading behavior
Proposed causes for boys’ underachievement

• Girls are favored by assessment (See Rauch and Hartig, 2010 re: PISA)

• Boys have more active learning styles that are less compatible with traditional school-based reading and writing literacy

• Boys’ challenges with proper classroom decorum influences teachers’ perceptions about their achievement and translate into lower grades for boys

Zyngier, D. (2009). Doing it to (for) boys (again): Do we really need more books telling us there is a problem with boys’ underachievement in education? *Gender and Education, 21*(1), 11-118.
Are classrooms more favorable to girls?

According to Whitmire (Why Boys Fail: Saving Our Sons from an Educational System That's Leaving Them Behind, 2011):
• Teaching methods are not designed to engage the minds of boys
• Boredom is an all too familiar side effect of classroom teaching, which leads to frustration and causes boys to exhibit behavioral problems and/or dislike of school

According to Jones and Myhill (2004):
• Teachers tend to associate boys with underachievement and girls with high achievement

According to Cornwell, Mustard, and Parys (2013):
• Boys commonly display worse behavior than girls, which can cause teachers to assign higher grades to girls over boys

- Analyzed the performance data on more than 5,800 students from kindergarten through fifth grade on standardized tests in reading, math and science and linked test scores to teachers' assessments of their students' progress, both academically and more broadly

- Gender disparities in teacher grades start early and uniformly favor girls

- In every subject area, boys were represented in grade distributions below where their test scores would predict

• This misalignment is attributed to non-cognitive skills, or "how well each child was engaged in the classroom, how often the child externalized or internalized problems, how often the child lost control and how well the child developed interpersonal skills."

• They also report evidence of a grade bonus for boys with behavior similar to their girl counterparts.
Jan Steen’s
*The Feast of Saint Nicholas*
1665-1668

Crying boy who must have been “naughty” receives coal in his shoe for Christmas

Good little girl receives a dolly, fruits, and other presents
Is boys’ underachievement a new phenomenon?

• In the U.S., gender-based achievement disparities evident in the early 1940s (Stroud & Lindquist, 1942)

• There may have always been a significant numbers of boys who have underachieved; more noticeable since the decline of industry and manufacturing

• Changes in the workplace focus attention on boys’ underachievement --up until the 1970s low academic qualifications were not necessarily a barrier to relatively high-paying jobs in manufacturing and industry

• Today there is a direct correlation between low qualifications and both joblessness and being trapped in low pay and unskilled work
I haven’t read any presidential biographies. I despise reports that run more than three pages, and my office doesn’t have any books on the shelves…except my own. Go on, try to sue me!

“The man who does not read has no advantage over the man who cannot read.”
--Mark Twain

Who says boys and men need to be active engaged readers to be successful?
Privilege and Reading Proficiency

• Boys who grow up in families and communities with high levels of class and status (according to social theorist Max Weber), and the privileges that come with these, have financial and social protections against disengaged literacy, aliteracy, poor academic performance, and lack of academic motivation

• Boys without these protections, need to “read for their lives” (according to Al Tatum)

Privilege and Reading Proficiency

• Hill’s (2014) path analysis of 117 African-American males who participated in PISA 2009 revealed a strong and significant direct effect of their fathers’ status and class on their sons’ print reading literacy proficiency

• Overall reading scores of these Black male participants were linked directly to the financial well-being and occupational status of their fathers

• As Hill stated it: “The more material resources Black fathers’ can provide to support their adolescent sons’ print reading literacy proficiency, the better they performed on PISA 2009 reading examination.”
What about those boys without financial and social privileges?

• Hernandez (2011) determined boys who can’t read on grade level by 3rd grade are four times less likely to graduate by age 19 than those who do read proficiently at that time

• If boys who can’t read on grade level live in poverty, then they are 13 times less likely to graduate on time

• Many of these dropouts find themselves among the ranks of the United State’s growing prison population
What about those boys without financial and social privileges?

• Sum and his colleagues (2009) found that about 1 in every 10 young male high school dropout is in jail or juvenile detention centers as compared to one in 35 young male high school graduates

• The picture is even bleaker for African-Americans, with nearly 1 in 4 young black male dropouts incarcerated or otherwise institutionalized on an average day
What about those boys without financial and social privileges?

• There is an undeniable relationship between lack of literacy and the probability of being imprisoned in the U.S.

• Cohen (2010) has shown that more than 60% of America’s inmates are illiterate, and 85% of all juvenile offenders have reading problems.
The higher boys’ PISA scores at age 15, the more likely they are to:

- Enroll in post-secondary education
- Choose more complex and higher-status major areas of study in post-secondary education
- Complete higher education, which slows skill loss as they age
- Have high earnings and low unemployment rates
- Speak two languages resulting in a salary premium
What do boys desire in a literacy curriculum?

• Blair & Sanford (2002)
• Canadian elementary school boys were tracked over three years.
• They were interviewed, observed in their classrooms, and observed during classroom literacy activities in which the boys were engaged.
What do boys desire in a literacy curriculum?

Analysis revealed five themes around which the boys’ literacy practices were constructed and which teachers would need to incorporate into their instructional activities to engage boys:

• personal interest
• action
• success
• fun
• purpose
Boys and New Literacies

- Definitions of literacy are expanding to include digital literacies, youth media, and virtually any act of meaning making as “reading.”

- Evidence can be found for male youth participating actively in the “mediasphere”

- Boys’ expertise with digital and media literacy may not be privileged and/or valued in most academic contexts
PISA 2009: Electronic Reading & Gender

• 16 OECD countries took part in both assessments

• Girls outperformed boys by 38 points – the equivalent of one year of formal schooling – in print reading, but by 24 points in digital reading.

• In each country, the increase in the percentage of top performers in digital reading over print reading was always greater among boys than among girls, as was the reduction in the percentage of poor performers.

• For girls and boys who were similarly proficient in print reading, boys scored an average of six points higher in digital reading.
PISA 2009: Electronic Reading & Gender

• Boys appear to be more competent than girls in selecting, organizing, and navigating pieces of information found in hypertexts

• Boys’ interest and abilities in digital reading could be exploited

• More frequent reading of digital texts could result in greater enjoyment of reading and better proficiency in print reading
Boys in the Mediasphere

• O’Brien has demonstrated how boys who fail with traditional school literacy tasks demonstrate literacy skills and competencies with their own media and technology

• Importance of creating spaces in schools for striving male readers’ everyday literacies so they can showcase and build on their strengths with the print and digital media they use on their own


“Dane”

Science – D
Math – D
English – C
History – D+
PE – B
Tardy often,
Several detentions
Dane’s literate practices outside of school: Rappin’ with his “Wingmen”

This beat ain’t right,” Dane tells Kwame and Jovan, stopping his rap after just a few lines. “It’s gotta be more lazy for the mood I’m trying to create.” “That’s cause you lazy,” Jovan quips, leaving the three of them laughing. Dane and his two friends are in a small room adjacent to Dane’s bedroom that has become a make-shift recording studio. Kwame searches another website where they usually find the best beats and calls up a slower, almost jazzy one with a muted though emphatic bass. Jovan returns to the cheap Casio keyboard, the one he had since he was a kid, that he excavated from the back of his closet, and puts down a repeating pattern of chords to go with the beat. Dane, using the handle King Negus, smiles, shifts his head from side to side with the rhythm, and restarts his rap:

Dane’s literate practices outside of school: Rappin’ with his “Wingmen”

One plus two plus three ways to be
It don’ matter to me ‘cause I’m divisible by three
Other brothas wanna be one thing, one thing only
But there’s a whole lotta lonely in acting one way
Thinking one way like this is yo last day to live
Give, unable to deliver when somethin’ new
Comes yo way
When I was a kid I got these faces from my dad
One had a smile one was sad
Like my face when my rap goes down
Or goes down in flames...
Take advantage of boys’ relative strengths with media and literacy outside of school

- playing computer and video games
- reading comic books and graphic novels
- reading related to their hobbies (skateboarding, collecting, sports, Rubik’s Cube)
- listening to music and reading and writing song lyrics
By eliminating barriers between students’ competencies with outside-of-school texts and classroom practices it is possible to increase engagement in learning and expand literacy abilities for striving readers (Sturtevant, Boyd, Brozo, Hinchman, Alvermann, & Moore, 2006).
Readers theater with graphic novel to improve fluency and have *fun*
Readers Theater with comic book version of *The Odyssey* to *increase comprehension* and have *fun*
Readers Theater with comic book version of *The Odyssey* to *increase comprehension* and have fun.
Bridge Books and Texts

• Goal is to motivate reluctant and disinterested boys to read required academic texts

• Canonical and required texts, even if “readable,” may turn boys off to reading without prior exposure to bridge texts

• Transition boys into challenging academic texts with texts that are engaging and put knowledge bases in place for academic literate tasks
Professional Note

My newest book with Teachers College Press demonstrates how to integrate graphic novels into the four major disciplines.

This approach appears to have particular appeal to boys.
New Orleans—Before and After Katrina

• United States Poet Laureate, Natasha Trethewey – poems set in New Orleans in early 20th century

• Graphic Novel about Katrina

• Story of Islamic man’s generosity after the New Orleans’ flood and then is a victim of racial profiling
The full text of a roadmap to peace in the Middle East, presented to Palestinian and Israeli leaders by Quartet mediators - the United Nations, European Union, United States and Russia. A performance-based roadmap to a permanent two-state solution to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

http://newsvote.bbc.co.uk/mpapps/pagetools/print/news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/2989783.stm
Poetry from a land of Conflict

• Poetry of Palestinian poet, Mahmoud Darwish

• Graphic Novel about Palestine

• Road Map to Peace to settle the Israeli-Palestinian conflict
The Odyssey

• Homer’s original epic poem

• Graphic novel about Ulysses (Roman version of Odysseus)

• Enrique’s Journey, Sonia Nazario’s novel about a Honduran boy’s own epic journey to find his mother in the United States
Graphic Novel as Bridge Text in History: Case Study

• “Mr. Brown” – American History teacher
  • Incorporated graphic novels into units and lessons
  • Had students read *Incognegro* (Pleece, 2008) in connection with a study of pre-Civil Rights era southern U.S.
  • Students also read *To Kill a Mockingbird* and *Letter from a Birmingham Jail*

• “Dane” – 10th grader in Mr. Brown’s history class, unmotivated, struggling reader, African-American
"Letter from a Birmingham Jail"

To Kill a Mockingbird

Incognegro
“Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere. We are caught in an inescapable network of mutuality, tied in a single garment of destiny. Whatever affects one directly, affects all indirectly…”

--M.L. King
Dane’s journal response to \textit{Incognegro}

The main character is a real light colored Black guy named Zane Pinchback. So am I. My mother is white. She’s from Germany and my father was from Ethiopia. Some kids with tans look darker than me. My hair is curly but not kinky. My mom is cool about who I hang out with. My friends are all Black. I also like this book because it’s a graphic novel. For me, these kind of books are a lot easier to read. I can read the words and if I’m not sure what’s going on or if the dialog isn’t too interesting, I can also look at the illustrations. The illustrations in this book are awesome. They really help you get into the story.
Dane’s journal response to *Incognegro*

I have a lot of respect for Blacks who fought for civil rights. They risked their lives. Zane is afraid whites will figure out he’s black, but he does what he can for his brother anyway. Reading about Zane and looking at the drawings of him, his brother, the angry whites and the other people made the book so real. Could I ever show the kind of courage Zane does or all those people who fought for their rights? I don’t know. But I think I am strong enough and proud enough. There’s one part of the book where Zane is looking right into your eyes. He is in Mississippi and he has found out who really killed the white woman. When I look into Zane’s eyes in that picture, it’s like I can see myself. He’s scared but confident that he must do the right thing.
Graphic Novel as Bridge Text in Science: Case Study

• Where
  8th grade science class in a suburban community in the national capital region

• Who
  Melissa—the science teacher, doctoral student in literacy/policy, former engineer
  Students—culturally and ethnically diverse group; 10% Els

• Gender Ratio
  24 total: 17 boys; 7 girls

Graphic Novel in Science

• **Background**
  - Melissa concerned about a mismatch between the school-provided texts and the reading abilities and interests of her students.
  
  - Assigned textbook was written at a level that exceeded the abilities of many of her students, especially English Learners (ELs), struggling readers, and reluctant readers—most of whom were boys.
Graphic Novel in Science

• Melissa made alternative texts available to her students at a lower reading level than the textbook

• Many boys, who could have benefited from these texts rejected them because their peers perceived them as “easy stuff” or “baby books”
Graphic Novel in Science

• Examined the results of state-level test data to isolate a curricular area in science—in this case, chemical reactions—which was problematic for her students and decided to use a graphic novel that was related to that curricular strand

• Finding a science graphic novel that was appropriate for her eighth grade science class involved visits to the school and local public libraries, as well as extensive Internet searches
Graphic Novel in Science

• The Materials & Method
  - Graphic novel: Chemical Reactions with Max Axiom (Biskup, 2011)
  
  - Written in a story format, with textbook features that include a table of contents, a glossary and suggestions for further reading
  
  - Main character is Max Axiom, an African American scientist working in an innovative laboratory, and just the kind of character who could make the science of chemical reactions interesting for her students
  
  - Illustrations are vivid and the vocabulary-rich; text is broken into frames and supported by insets that reinforce vocabulary and important concepts.
Using powers he acquired in a freak accident, Max teaches science in ways never before seen in a classroom. Whether shrinking to explore an atom or riding on a sound wave, Max does what it takes to make science super cool.
Graphic Novel in Science

• Using the graphic novel, Melissa’s goal was to help students attain a deeper understanding of the new vocabulary and to reinforce the familiar vocabulary on chemical reactions

• One week unit

• In addition to the graphic novel for this unit, a variety of materials, including class textbook, magazine articles, and video were used
Graphic Novel in Science

Overall Findings

• Of particular interest was how a handful of the boys who were generally indifferent to class activities and assignments were much more engaged during this unit.

• The test, quiz, and assignment grades for these students were well above their average scores on previous units.

• This was encouraging, since the unit on chemical reactions always posed significant challenges to the students, especially struggling ones.
Boys’ Comments about the Unit

• Miguel
  “My English isn’t good, but Max Axiom had pictures that showed me what I needed to know.”

• Louis
  “The book is too hard; this was a lot easier.”

• Dre
  “Max is cool. He shows you stuff you can’t get in the book. I got a good grade over it.”

• Manolo
  “This is the first book (in English) I read all the way through.”
With the American rapper Snoop Dogg’s lyrics for “I Love to Give You Light” a 7th grade special reading class of mostly boys found numerous examples of words with /ck/ and /ch/ blends. These words were written into a t-chart in their vocabulary notebooks.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ch</th>
<th>ck</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>such</td>
<td>background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preach</td>
<td>jackers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chuuch</td>
<td>glock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teachin</td>
<td>block</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>watchin</td>
<td>locked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>each</td>
<td>black</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preachin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>purchase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>beach</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Popular Music as Context for Learning and Using New Vocabulary

- The students worked with a partner to think of new words with the /ch/ and /ck/ sounds and add them to the t-chart.

- Student pairs then wrote their own rap lyrics that contained all or some of the new words they generated for the two word families.

- As one student read the rap the other kept rhythm on his desk top:

  I put my **socks** in my **backpack** when I go to school.
  I put my backpack in my locker or I look like a fool.
  I get my socks from my backpack when I go to gym
  Where I catch the ball then stick it in the rim.

- As a result, students were better able to recognize and pronounce words with these elements that they encountered in their school-related and everyday reading.
Cross-age and reading buddies

“The most potent benefit of such a program (cross-age tutoring partnership program) is that it imbues struggling readers with a sense of responsibility and purpose for improving their own abilities”  --Brozo & Hargis, (2003)
Reading Buddies for Boys

• Gender- and cultural-matched role models have the most positive effect on educational outcomes (Zirkel, 2002) and are sorely needed in the lives of many boys (Brozo, 2010)
COMPONENTS OF A CROSS-AGE BUDDY READING PROGRAM FOR BOYS

• One older struggling male reader paired with one younger novice or struggling reader

• Older student prepares reading material and strategies

• Reads to and with younger male student, helping with word attack and comprehension

• Makes a book or some other project together based on younger student’s interests and experiences

• One to three sessions per week

• Can occur in the school or public library
Reading Buddies

• 17-year-old Tremayne & 2nd grader LaBron in a cross-age tutoring program

• Read about and researched Chicago Bears American football team and players

• Led to reading about performance enhancement drugs, steroids

• Explored the exaggeratedly muscled heroes and villains in computer games, such as *True Crime: Streets of LA* (Activision), *WWF Wrestlemania* (THQ), *Take No Prisoners* (Red Orb), *The Hulk* (Vivendi-Universal), *Army Men: Sarge's Heroes* (3DO), and *X-Men: Mutant Academy* (Activision)
Reading Buddies

• Pictures were then downloaded into Adobe Photoshop so they could be altered

• Tremayne and LaBron learned how to rework the main characters' physiques, reshaping them in ways that were more proportional to normal muscle development

• They displayed their work in a PowerPoint presentation with "before" slides, accompanied by captions warning of the dangers of steroids and other illegal substances for building muscle, and "after" slides with statements about good health, diet, and fitness
FINAL THOUGHTS ABOUT BOYS AND READING...

- Discover who each boy is individually
- Focus attention on boys who are the neediest, the most vulnerable, the most reluctant readers
- Find the right reading material, at the right levels, and offer it in the right ways
- Respect boys’ interests in texts and media and work cooperatively to gain and hold boys’ interests
- Support relationships between younger and older boys and men who can model the pleasures and benefits of active literacy
- View boys as a resource in their own literacy development to improve the chances of elevating their achievement
Thank You!

Youth are our hope for the future...

But you are their hope today!
References


References


References


References


References


References


